March 11, 2020

Dear Reviewer(s) and Area Chair(s),

It is our pleasure to submit our article named "Erasing Appearance Preservation in Image Smoothing" for review to the European Conference on Computer Vision 2020. This article was rejected from CVPR 2020. However, we feel encouraged to resubmit an improved version for review. We have also attached previous reviews and rebuttals.

After the CVPR 2020 rebuttal, our final ratings were "weak accept, weak accept, borderline", with the following unsolved concerns: (1) Our novelty was not highlighted, and the citations for the relevant point-based imaging literature were missing; (2) Our motivation was not adequately discussed to support the effectiveness of the solution; (3) The mathematical treatment was a bit careless, and a regulation term was not discussed; (4) We lacked experiments to repeat the existing image smoothing algorithms multiple times.

In the revision, we have respectively improved the following points:

- We have completely rewritten the related expositions to highlight the uniqueness of the problem that we are studying. We have carefully cited and discussed related works. We have also made our claims more accurate, in order to differ our studied unique problem from existing works.

- We have thoroughly revised our motivation for the overall problem formulation and the detailed knapsack modeling. We have also conducted an user study, yielding a large number of solid evidences to support our motivation and to verify the effectiveness of our modeling.

- We have attentively proofread all mathematical formulations, and added the missing discussion for the regulation term.

- We have carefully conducted the requested experiment to repeat existing image smoothing algorithms multiple times, yielding a large number of comparisons, as presented in the main article and the supplementary material. We have also conducted an ablative study to further validate the effectiveness of our problem modeling.

Furthermore, we have also streamlined the video and revised our codes.

Sincerely,

Anonymous Authors